

MEETING OF THE BOARD OF CANVASSERS  
AND THE MEETING OF THE COMMISSIONERS OF ELECTIONS  
IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK  
HELD ON TUESDAY, DECEMBER 3, 2019 AT 1:30 P.M.  
42 BROADWAY, 6<sup>th</sup> FLOOR, COMMISSIONERS' HEARING ROOM  
NEW YORK, NY 10004

---

PRESENT:       President John Wm. Zaccone  
                  Secretary Patricia Anne Taylor

Commissioners Jose Araujo, Miguelina Camilo, John Flateau, Michael Michel, Simon Shamoun, Tiffany Townsend, Frederic M. Umane

Michael J. Ryan, Executive Director  
Pamela Perkins, Administrative Manager  
Georgea Kontzamanis, Operations Manager  
Steven H. Richman, General Counsel  
Raphael Savino, Deputy General Counsel  
Valerie Vazquez, Communications and Public Affairs  
Steven Guglielmi, Director, Personnel  
Troy Johnson, Coordinator, Candidate Records Unit  
Rayvon Weaver, Project Coordinator, Candidate Records Unit  
Don Bosco, Chief Clerk, Staten Island Office  
Anthony Andriulli, Deputy Chief Clerk, Staten Island Office  
Brendaliz Candelaria, Deputy Chief Clerk, Bronx Office  
Robert Siano, Deputy Chief Clerk, Bronx Office  
Raymond Riley, Chief Clerk, Brooklyn Office  
Daniel Ortiz, Deputy Chief Clerk, Brooklyn Office  
Amanda Berinato, Chief Clerk, Queens Office  
Bart Haggerty, Deputy Chief Clerk, Queens Office  
Greg Lehman, Chief Clerk, Manhattan Office  
Cynthia Doty, Deputy Chief Clerk, Manhattan Office  
Kenneth Moltner, Counsel to the Commissioners  
Steven B. Denkberg, Counsel to the Commissioners

GUEST:       Eve Grassfield, NYC Mayor's Office  
                  Katharine Loving, NYC Campaign Finance Board

Wendy Byrne, LWV NYC  
Kate Doran, LWV NYC  
Amanda Ritchie, BVA  
Julie Kerr, BVA  
Erica Cohen, BVA  
Perry Grossman, NYCLU  
Pat Nolen, BVA

---

President Zaccone called the meeting to order at 1:33 P.M.

Pursuant to the provisions of Title 2 of Article 9 of the New York State Election Law, specifically Sections 9-204, 9-206, 9-210, and 9-212, President Zaccone convened the Meeting of the Board of Canvassers in the City of New York to certify the recanvas of votes cast on November 5, 2019 in the General Election conducted in the City of New York.

To serve as the other Republican Member of the Canvassing Board, President Zaccone designated the Republican Commissioner for their respective counties and Commissioner Umame to serve with him for Richmond County, Bronx County and the multi-county recaps. Secretary Taylor designated the Democratic Commissioner for their respective counties and Commissioner Camilo to serve with her for Richmond County and the multi-county recaps.

President Zaccone reported that the November 5, 2019 General Election included the election for New York City Public Advocate, a Member of the New York City Council, District Attorneys in three (3) counties as well as Judges in all of the five (5) counties within the City of New York. The November General Election was the first to include Early Voting under State Legislation enacted earlier this year. These additional nine (9) days of voting required the Board to plan, organize, and conduct voting throughout the City at sixty-one (61) sites. The Board staff worked seven (7) days a week and twelve (12) or more hours a day to ensure that every voter had a pleasant voting experience, and that every vote lawfully cast has been counted accurately and correctly.

The Deputy Chief Clerks of the Bronx and their staff have prepared and signed the Statement and Return of Canvass for the General Election conducted in Bronx County on November 5, 2019. The Statement and Return of Canvass were presented to the Canvassing Board for review and approval. Ms. Candelaria and Mr. Siano confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, all the provisions of the New York State Election Law and the Board's Policies and Procedures were complied with, and the audit of voter verifiable audit records for the poll site, including Early Voting sites and central count scanners required by

Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests. There are no discrepancies. Based on that report, Commissioner Camilo moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Statement and Return of Canvass for the General Election conducted in Bronx County on November 5, 2019. Commissioner Umame seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted. Commissioner Camilo and Commissioner Umame thanked the Bronx Office staff for their diligent work this election cycle.

The Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk of Brooklyn and their staff have prepared and signed the Statement and Return of Canvass for the General Election conducted in Kings County on November 5, 2019. The Statement and Return of Canvass were presented to the Canvassing Board for review and approval. Mr. Riley and Mr. Ortiz confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, all the provisions of the New York State Election Law and the Board's Policies and Procedures were complied with, and the audit of voter verifiable audit records for the poll site, including Early Voting sites and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests. There are no discrepancies. Based on that report, Commissioner Flateau moved that the Board of

Canvassers certify the Statement and Return of Canvass for the General Election conducted in Kings County on November 5, 2019. Commissioner Shamoun seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted. Commissioner Shamoun and Commissioner Flateau thanked the Brooklyn Office staff for their diligent work this election cycle.

The Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk of Manhattan and their staff have prepared and signed the Statement and Return of Canvass for the General Election conducted in New York County on November 5, 2019. The Statement and Return of Canvass were presented to the Canvassing Board for review and approval. Mr. Lehman and Ms. Doty confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, all the provisions of the New York State Election Law and the Board's Policies and Procedures were complied with, and the audit of voter verifiable audit records for the poll site, including Early Voting sites and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests. There are no discrepancies. Based on that report, Commissioner Townsend moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Statement and Return of Canvass for the General Election conducted in New York County on November 5, 2019. Commissioner Umane seconded the motion, which was unanimously

adopted. Commissioner Umane and Commissioner Townsend thanked the Manhattan Office staff for their diligent work this election cycle.

The Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk of Queens and their staff have prepared and signed the Statement and Return of Canvass for the General Election conducted in Queens County on November 5, 2019. The Statement and Return of Canvass were presented to the Canvassing Board for review and approval. Ms. Berinato and Mr. Haggerty confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, all the provisions of the New York State Election Law and the Board's Policies and Procedures were complied with, and the audit of voter verifiable audit records for the poll site, including Early Voting sites and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests. There are no discrepancies. Based on that report, Commissioner Araujo moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Statement and Return of Canvass for the General Election conducted in Queens County on November 5, 2019. Commissioner Michel seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted. Commissioner Araujo and Commissioner Michel thanked the Queens Office staff for their diligent work this election cycle.

The Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk of Staten Island and their staff have prepared and signed the Statement and Return of Canvass for the General Election conducted in Richmond County on November 5, 2019. The Statement and Return of Canvass were presented to the Canvassing Board for review and approval. Mr. Bosco and Mr. Andriulli confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, all the provisions of the New York State Election Law and the Board's Policies and Procedures were complied with, and the audit of voter verifiable audit records for the poll site, including Early Voting sites and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests. There are no discrepancies. Based on that report, Secretary Taylor moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Statement and Return of Canvass for the General Election conducted in Richmond County on November 5, 2019. President Zaccone seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted. President Zaccone and Secretary Taylor thanked the Staten Island Office staff for their diligent work this election cycle.

Secretary Taylor moved to approve and adopt the Recap Statement and Return of Canvass for the General Election conducted on November 5, 2019 for the citywide public office and the five citywide ballot

questions which cross county lines within the City of New York and whose respective counties' Statement and Return of Canvass have been approved. Commissioner Umane seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Commissioner Umane moved to electronically affix the appropriate Commissioners' signatures as previously designated on each Statement and Return of Canvass. Commissioner Flateau seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Pursuant to the provisions of Section 9-214 of the New York State Election Law and in accordance with the actions taken today by the Board of Canvassers in the City of New York, Board staff is directed to transmit forthwith certified copies of the adopted Statements and Returns of Canvass to the New York State Board of Elections and the Secretary of State of the State of New York.

Secretary Taylor moved to adjourn the meeting of the Board of Canvassers and to convene the weekly stated meeting of the Commissioners of Elections in the City of New York. Commissioner Townsend seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Mr. Richman presented the Draft Designating Petition Rules and Draft Calendar for the 2020 Presidential Primary for selecting Delegates and Alternate Delegates to a National Convention. Copies of the Draft Rules and Calendar were previously circulated to the Commissioners for review. Mr. Richman provided an overview of the Draft Rules and Draft Calendar. Mr. Richman recommended scheduling the Hearings on Specifications of Objections and related matters to Designating Petitions on Tuesday, February 25, 2020 at 1:30 P.M. It was noted that the Hearings date can be changed, if needed. Commissioner Araujo moved to adopt the Designating Petition Rules and Calendar for the 2020 Presidential Primary for selecting Delegates and Alternate Delegates to a National Convention as submitted. President Zaccone seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted. The adopted Rules and Calendar will be posted for the public. Commissioner Araujo requested for the adopted Rules and Calendar to be emailed to the Commissioners.

Mr. Ryan reported that the Board received a request from Kimisis Theotokou Greek Orthodox Church to use a lever voting machine for an Election of the Board of Trustees to be held on December 15, 2019. The Church will cover any and all expenses associated with use, delivery and pick up of the lever machine. A copy of the letter was distributed to the

Commissioners for review. Commissioner Umane recalled that in the past the Board historically would not permit private use of lever machines except for Co-Op City. He noted that there are private election companies and that Board staff would have to setup the lever machine. Commissioner Shamoun moved to approve the request submitted by Kimisis Theotokou Greek Orthodox Church in Brooklyn for this case only. Commissioner Michel seconded the motion. In a roll call vote with six (6) in favor (Araujo, Camilo, Michel, Shamoun, Townsend, Zaccone), one (1) opposed (Umane), and two (2) abstentions (Flateau and Taylor), the motion was adopted.

President Zaccone recognized the following speaker for public comment:

1. Amanda Ritchie

Commissioner Shamoun moved to convene an Executive Session for personnel matters. Commissioner Umane seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Following Executive Session, the open public meeting resumed. President Zaccone reported that security and personnel matters were discussed which will be reported in the minutes.

The following personnel actions were taken by unanimous decision of the Board of Commissioners in Executive Session:

- I. Raquel Torres, an Administrative Assistant, was granted 35 hours of an Advance of Time. The grant will be effective December 2, 2019. Ms. Torres' agency start date is March 11, 2012. Commissioner Araujo was not present for this decision;
- II. Daniel Castorina, an Administrative Assistant, was granted 35 hours of an Advance of Time. The grant will be effective December 9, 2019. Mr. Castorina's agency start date is December 19, 2016; and;
- III. Abigail McGloster, a Senior Administrative Assistant, was granted 210 hours of an Advance of Time. The grant will be effective December 3, 2019. Ms. McGloster's agency start Date is March 25, 2012.

The next stated meeting of the Commissioners is scheduled for Tuesday, December 10, 2019 at 1:30 P.M.

Commissioner Flateau moved to adjourn the meeting. Secretary Taylor seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.