

HEARINGS RELATING TO SPECIFICATIONS OF OBJECTIONS  
AND RELATED MATTERS FOR JUDGE OF THE CIVIL COURT,  
1<sup>ST</sup> MUNICIPAL COURT DISTRICT IN RICHMOND COUNTY,  
IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK  
HELD ON FRIDAY, AUGUST 30, 2019 AT 11:00 A.M.  
42 BROADWAY, 6<sup>th</sup> FLOOR, COMMISSIONERS' HEARING ROOM  
NEW YORK, NY 10004

---

PRESENT:       President John Wm. Zaccone  
                  Secretary Patricia Anne Taylor

Commissioners Michael Michel, Tiffany Townsend, Robert Siano

Michael J. Ryan, Executive Director  
Dawn Sandow, Deputy Executive Director  
Georgea Kontzamanis, Operations Manager  
Steven H. Richman, General Counsel  
Raphael Savino, Deputy General Counsel  
Kenneth Moltner, Counsel to the Commissioners

GUEST:       Stanley Schlein, Esq.  
                  John Ciampoli, Esq.  
                  Shawn Malachovsky

---

President Zaccone called the meeting to order at 11:10 A.M.

President Zaccone noted that Commissioner Townsend is participating by videoconference, and Commissioner Siano is observing the Hearings and not voting on any matters.

President Zaccone called the Hearings relating on Specifications of Objections and related matters for the public office of Judge of the Civil Court of the City of New York for the 1<sup>st</sup> Municipal Court District in Richmond County to be contested in the November 5, 2019 General Election. President Zaccone noted that the Commissioners established a Commissioners' Committee on August 26, 2019 to act for the full Board with respect to the matters that appear on the Calendar.

President Zaccone stated the procedures to be followed during the Hearings and called upon Mr. Richman to call the Calendar for the Hearings. The Calendar was posted for the public as required.

Mr. Richman called the Counsels' Report on Specifications of Objections RH 1-1, Objections of Christopher E. Campbell to the Independence Party substitution of Shawn Malachovsky as the candidate for Judge of the Civil Court in the City of New York for the 1<sup>st</sup> Municipal Court District in Richmond County. There were appearances by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the Counsels' Report on file at the Board. The Commissioners' determination is reflected on the Counsel's Report on file at the Board.

Mr. Richman called the Counsels' Reports on Specifications of Objections RH 2-1, Objections of John S. Mahoney to the Democratic Party Certificate of Nomination of Edwina Frances Martin as the candidate for Judge of the Civil Court in the City of New York for the 1<sup>st</sup> Municipal Court District in Richmond County. There were appearances by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the Counsels' Reports on file at the Board. The Commissioners' determination is reflected on the Counsels' Reports on file at the Board.

President Zaccone noted that any Exhibits containing confidential information must be redacted in the future.

President Zaccone reported that the Board has received the following Applications for review and consideration:

1. Application of Edwina Frances Martin to appear on the November 5, 2019 General Election ballot as Edwina "Winnie" Martin;
2. Application of Robert Helbock to appear on the November 5, 2019 General Election ballot as Bob Helbock;

3. Application of Shachar Shawn Malachovsky to appear on the November 5, 2019 General Election ballot as Shawn Malachovsky.

Copies of the Applications were distributed to the Commissioners for review and consideration. After review, President Zaccone moved to approve the three (3) Applications subject to the Board's findings and subsequent court orders. Secretary Taylor seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

President Zaccone reported that if additional Specifications of Objections are filed at the Board, there will be a Hearing at the next stated meeting on September 10, 2019 at 1:30 P.M.

Secretary Taylor moved to adjourn the Hearings. Commissioner Michel seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.