MEETING OF THE COMMISSIONERS OF ELECTIONS IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK HELD ON TUESDAY, MAY 9, 2017 AT 1:30 P.M. 42 BROADWAY, 6th FLOOR, COMMISSIONERS' HEARING ROOM NEW YORK, NY 10004

PRESENT: President Frederic M. Umane Secretary Rosanna Vargas

Commissioners Jose Araujo, John Flateau, Maria R. Guastella, Michael Michel, Alan Schulkin, Simon Shamoun, Robert Siano, John Wm. Zaccone

Michael J. Ryan, Executive Director Dawn Sandow, Deputy Executive Director Pamela Perkins, Administrative Manager Georgea Kontzamanis, Operations Manager Steven H. Richman, General Counsel Raphael Savino, Deputy General Counsel Nina M. Crispino, Director, Personnel Kenneth Moltner, Counsel to the Commissioners Steven B. Denkberg, Counsel to the Commissioners

GUEST: Amanda Melillo, NYC CFB Kate Doran, LWVNYC Rosemarie Hameed Katharine Loving, NYC Campaign Finance Board Brigid Bergin, WNYC Alan Flacks, Member of NY County Democratic Committee

President Umane called the meeting to order at 1:37 P.M.

Commissioner Araujo moved to adopt the minutes for the May 2, 2017 meeting. Commissioner Schulkin seconded the motion, with Commissioners Guastella and Michel abstaining. The motion was adopted.

President Umane added an Executive Session for a Queens personnel matter and litigation.

President Umane noted that Secretary Vargas and Mr. Ryan joined the meeting.

Mr. Ryan advised the Commissioners that staff has contacted the New York City Department of Citywide Administrative Services (DCAS) to explore the procedure for Shoup voting machine disposal. There are a total of 7,709 Shoup machines and a bidding process is required to dispose of City property. Mr. Ryan reported that he will bring this matter before the Commissioners for approval after staff compiles detailed information on the City's disposal process.

President Umane inquired about using the Shoup machines for the potential 2017 Primary Run-off Election. Mr. Ryan reported that the Board cannot utilize the Shoup machines without legislation and there has been

2

no action to date. The Board is planning to use the DS-200 voting machines. Mr. Ryan noted that he hopes the New York State Legislature will act and grant the Board an additional week in between the Primary and Potential Run-off Elections which would result in approximately \$1.4 million in cost savings. In between the Primary and Potential Run-off Elections timeframe, there would be overtime costs associated with NYC DOE staff and the voting machine truckers due to Rosh Hashanah, as well as voting machine delivery delays as a result of the General Assembly of the United Nations street closures.

Mr. Ryan provided an update on the Board's tasks and operations in preparation for the May 23, 2017 Special Election in the 30th State Senate District in Manhattan. The information follows:

- The testing of the scanners and Ballot Marking Devices (BMDs) commenced on May 8th and will be completed by the end of the week;
- There has been coordination with the NYPD, NYC DOE, NYCHA, and private poll site representatives regarding Election Day operations within their buildings;
- Election Day Operations supplies will be delivered tomorrow;

- 97% of the necessary poll workers have been assigned to work to date;
- There are a total of 62 Chinese interpreters and 78 Spanish interpreters assigned to work. Currently, there are 4 Chinese interpreter vacancies and 3 Spanish interpreter vacancies;
- The Board's ADA Coordinators will be out in the field on Election Day focusing their efforts on poll sites that had issues in the past so that those issues are not repeated;
- A total of 44 poll sites require temporary ramp remediation:
 - 21 ramps will be installed by the ramp vendor;
 - 10 ramps will be installed by Borough Office staff;
 - 13 ramps will be installed by on-site NYC DOE staff;
- A total of 72 poll sites will be open on Election Day;
- Central ballot canvass testing commences on May 15th;
- The Election Night Results (ENR) testing commences tomorrow;
- Canvass support commences post-election on May 24th;
- All absentee ballots were mailed on April 6th and the returned live ballots are scheduled to be delivered to the Voting Machine Facility (VMF) by Thursday;
- Poll books are scheduled to be generated and produced for delivery to the VMF on Thursday;

- A total of 193 tablets will be deployed on Election Day:
 - 150 tablets in the poll sites Poll Worker Check-in, Table
 Finder, Poll Site Locator, and Election Night Reporting Apps
 will be utilized;
 - 33 tablets in the field Election Day Responder, Table
 Finder, and Poll Site Locator Apps will be utilized;
 - 10 tablets in the Police Precincts;
- There are a total of 201,809 registered voters in the 30th State Senate District;
- A total of 2,292 individual pieces of equipment will be deployed which includes 199 Scanners.

Commissioner Flateau inquired if there will be any media outreach concerning the May 23, 2017 Special Election. Mr. Richman reported that half-page legal ads are required to be printed in two (2) newspapers of general circulation in English and the other covered languages pursuant to the New York State Election Law. There are no provisions in the NYS Election Law for legally mandated notices concerning Special Elections. President Umane noted that direct mailings would be sent to voters if there was a poll site change. President Umane recognized Rosemarie Hameed, a member of the public, who inquired about the Board's ADA Coordinators.

On behalf of the Commissioners, President Umane welcomed new Contract Attorney Nia Stanford to the Board.

President Umane recognized Amanda Melillo, a representative of the NYC Campaign Finance Board (CFB), who announced that their bi-annual hearing is scheduled today at 5:30 P.M. at 100 Church Street. Ms. Melillo reminded that the "I Voted" sticker design contests ends today.

Commissioner Flateau inquired if the NYC CFB sends out a mailing to voters for Special Elections. Ms. Melillo reported that the NYC CFB sends out a reduced version of their mailer to the voters in the district.

President Umane recognized Alan Flacks, a member of the public, who welcomed the new Staten Island Republican Commissioner and inquired about the new Contract Attorney.

President Umane added a Bronx personnel matter for Executive Session.

6

Commissioner Araujo moved to convene Executive Session for purposes of personnel and litigation. Commissioner Shamoun seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Following Executive Session, the open public meeting resumed and Mr. Ryan reported the following actions that were taken in Executive Session:

- The Commissioners granted an advance of 161 hours to Heide Wilcox, a Permanent Financial Clerk in the Queens Office, retroactive to April 26, 2017. Ms. Wilcox's agency start date is October 14, 2012;
- II. Following a Disciplinary Hearing, Donald Cokley, a Senior Programmer in the General Office, was placed on probation for six (6) months and must cooperate with the Employee Assistance Program (EAP);
- III. Jose Zapata was promoted to the title of Project Coordinator in the General Office at the incoming rate of pay, effective May 7, 2017.Mr. Zapata's agency start date is April 2, 2017;
- IV. Antonio Ortiz was promoted to the title of Senior Systems Analyst in the General Office at the outgoing salary, retroactive to January 29, 2017. Mr. Ortiz's agency start date is

7

August 27, 1995. This action creates a vacancy for the title of Senior Programmer.

Commissioner Flateau moved to adjourn the meeting. President Umane seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The next stated meeting of the Commissioners will be held on Tuesday, May 16, 2017 at 1:30 P.M.